CAR Section I Liability Revision Date Page 1 of 12

This Experience Rating Plan is designed and its rating parameters have been calculated using experience for basic limits Bodily Injury Liability (BI), Personal Injury Protection (PIP), and Property Damage Liability (PDL). Premises and operations liability is also included for garage risks. Therefore, the premiums and losses used in deriving the experience modification for any risk under this Plan should include data from only these coverages.

A. ELIGIBILITY

The term risk as used in this Plan means the exposures of any one insured which are to be rated. Allied or subsidiary interests shall not be included unless:

- 1. The insured holds a majority financial interest therein, or
- 2. The following conditions exist under an exclusive franchise arrangement between the franchise grantor and the other interests to be rated:
 - a. all interests operate under a common trade name, and
 - b. all interests use one or more identical products or services obtained through the franchise grantor, and
 - c. one source establishes and maintains standards regarding management control and is responsible for insurance premium payment for all interests operating under the exclusive franchise, and
 - d. there is no legal prohibition against ownership by the franchise grantor of the operations of the other interests to be rated.

Expenses other than allocated loss adjustment expenses are not taken into consideration in the parameters of this Plan.

Any risk meeting the following qualifications for the BI, PIP, and PDL exposure to be rated shall be eligible for the application of this Plan:

- (1) Five or more private passenger or commercial automobiles, one or more taxicabs, three or more public automobiles of any other type, or five or more plates of any type for risks which include registration plates not issued for a specific automobile such as garage risks, or the equivalent of such exposures for automobiles hired by the risk, or
- (2) Annual basic limits manual premium of at least \$2,500, including premises and operations premium, for garage risks not subject to the Massachusetts Compulsory Law, or for employers non-ownership

CAR Section I Liability Revision Date Page 2 of 12 Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan Liability 2020.07.01

liability exposure. Note that the headquarters location of the risk shall govern the application of this Plan for all employers non-ownership liability exposures regardless of location.

B. EXPERIENCE MODIFICATION

The experience modification for the risk shall be determined in accordance with the experience rating procedure described herein and shall be applied to the total current manual premium, including all increased limits, and premises and operations for garage risks for the BI, PIP, and PDL coverages on the policy being rated.

C. EXPERIENCE USED

The experience modification shall be determined, by the company establishing the rating, from the latest available three completed policy years of experience incurred in this state, or in all states by the risk. In the event the experience for the full experience period is not available, at least two completed policy years shall be used. Risks with less than two completed policy years of experience shall not be experience rated. The experience period shall end at least six months prior to the rating date.

Experience developed by companies other than the company establishing the modification or self-insured experience may be used subject to the periods specified above. If the risk has been self-insured or insured with a company from which the experience is not obtainable, the experience may be used if submitted to the company in the form of a statement signed by the insured. Experience in such form may be excluded from the rating if its reliability can not be established.

D. DETERMINATION OF EXPERIENCE MODIFICATION

The term basic limits shall mean \$20,000/40,000 BI, \$8,000 PIP, and \$5,000 PDL.

1. Total Basic Limits Premium Subject to Experience Rating

The premiums to be included in the rating are calculated as follows:

a. Determine the current annual basic limits premium for BI, PIP and PDL for the policy being rated using CAR's current manual rates. The policy being rated is the policy to which the experience modification of D.6. of this Section shall apply.

CAR | Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan | Section I | Liability | 2020.07.01 | Page | 3 of 12

b. The annual basic limits premium for each year of the experience period is the annual basic limits premium determined according to D.1.a. of this Section, multiplied by the appropriate detrend factor from Table A of this Section.

Liability Experience Rating Plan Factors Table A – Premium Detrend Factors

		2 nd	3 rd
	Latest Year	Latest Year	Latest Year
Taxi	0.935	0.905	0.877
All Other	0.908	0.867	0.830

- c. The total basic limits premium subject to experience rating is equal to the sum of the detrended annual basic limits premiums calculated according to D.1.b. of this Section.
- d. If exposures have changed during the experience period, refer to the supplement to determine if an alternative rating methodology is in order.

2. <u>Basic Limits Losses Subject to Experience Rating</u>

The losses to be included in the rating shall be the total of the following:

- a. Paid and outstanding losses, including allocated loss adjustment expense (ALAE) for each year in the experience period, with the indemnity amount limited to basic limits, and with the amount of indemnity and allocated loss adjustment expense resulting from any single occurrence limited by the maximum single loss (MSL) value specified in Table C of this Section based on the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating.
 - Property damage losses and ALAE from the experience period shall be adjusted to the deductible basis, if any, that applies for the policy being rated.
- b. Adjustment to reflect ultimate level of losses for each year in the experience period, is calculated by multiplying the annual basic limits premium from D.1.b. of this Section for the year by the adjusted expected loss ratio (AELR) and by the appropriate basic limits loss development factor (LDF). The formula for this adjustment is P x AELR x LDF, where
 - (1) P is the annual basic limits premium for the particular year in the experience period from D.1.b. of this Section.

CAR | Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan | Section I | Liability | 2020.07.01 | Page | 4 of 12

- (2) AELR is the adjusted expected loss ratio specified in Table C of this Section based on the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating from D.1.c. of this Section. If a risk includes more than one vehicle type, then the AELR from Table C of this Section should be the AELR for the predominant class of risk on the policy.
- (3) LDF is the appropriate CAR basic limits loss development factor from Table B of this Section.

Liability Experience Rating Plan Factors Table B – Loss Development Factors

	Latest <u>Year</u>		\mathbf{L}	2 nd atest <u>ear</u>		3 rd atest <u>ear</u>		ors for ature e <u>s*</u>
	Taxi	All	Taxi	All	Taxi	All	Taxi	All
		Other		Other		Other		Other
Maturity (Months)	18	18	30	30	42	42	6	6
LDF	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.670	0.735
Maturity (Months)	21	21	33	33	45	45	9	9
LDF	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.301	0.376
Maturity (Months)	24	24	36	36	48	48	12	12
LDF	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.009	0.070
Maturity (Months)	27	27	39	39	51	51	15	15
LDF	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000

* In cases where an insured has changed carriers, the company establishing the rating may be unable to obtain current valuations of past losses from previous carriers. Therefore losses may be evaluated at less than 18 months.

The maturity of the losses for any year in the experience period is defined as the number of months between the latest loss valuation and the effective date of the policy to which these losses are assignable.

3. Actual Loss Ratio

Determine the actual loss ratio (ALR) by dividing the basic limits losses subject to experience rating from D.2.a. and D.2.b. of this Section by the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating from D.1.c. of this Section.

CAR | Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan | Section I | Liability | 2020.07.01 | Page | 5 of 12

4. Credibility

The credibility for the risk is obtained from Table C of this Section, based on the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating.

5. Adjusted Expected Loss Ratio

The AELR for the risk is obtained from Table C of this Section based on the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating. If a risk includes more than one vehicle type, then the AELR from Table C of this Section should be the AELR for the predominant class of risk on the policy.

6. Experience Modification

If the experience modification is negative, it is a credit; if positive, it is a debit.

CAR Section I Liability Revision Date Page 6 of 12 Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan Liability Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan Liability

LIABILITY EXPERIENCE RATING PLAN EXAMPLE

I. Basic Information

Assume the policy to be rated is effective 05/01/20 - 04/30/21 for private passenger type vehicles.

Assume the basic limits premium for BI, PIP, and PDL using CAR rates effective 05/01/20 is \$25,000.

Assume the losses and ALAE for three years, evaluated as of 05/01/20, are as follows:

<u>Year</u> (1)	Maturity (2)	Total Limits Losses (3)	Basic Limits Losses (4)	<u>ALAE</u> (5)	Basic Limits Losses & ALAE (4) + (5) (6)
05/01/16 - 04/30/17	48	\$ 1,500 500 100,000	\$ 1,500 500 20,000	\$ 500 100 20,000	\$ 2,000 600 40,000
05/01/17 - 04/30/18	36	750 250	750 250	100 50	850 300
05/01/18 - 04/30/19	24	250 500 22,250	250 500 20,000	50 700 5,000	300 1,200 25,000

CAR Section I Liability Revision Date Page 7 of 12 Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan Liability Page 7 of 12

II. <u>Total Basic Limits Premium Subject to Experience Rating</u> (See D.1. of this Section)

<u>Year</u> (1)	Annual Basic Limits Premium (2)	Table A Detrend Factors (3)	Basic Limits Premium Subject to Experience Rating (4)
3 rd Latest Year	\$ 25,000	0.830	\$ 20,750
2 nd Latest Year	25,000	0.867	21,675
Latest Year	25,000	0.908	22,700
			\$ 65,125

From Table C of this Section, given the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating of \$65,125, the credibility is 0.26, the AELR is 0.636, and the MSL is \$36,150. (See D.1., 2. and 3. of this Section)

III. Basic Limits Losses Subject to Experience Rating

A. Paid and Outstanding Losses & ALAE (See D.2. of this Section)

<u>Year</u> (1)	Basic Limits Losses & ALAE (2)	Basic Limits Losses & ALAE Subject to MSL of \$36,150 (3)
05/01/16 - 04/30/17	\$ 2,000 600 40,000	\$ 2,000 600 36,150
05/01/17 - 04/30/18	850 300	850 300
05/01/18 - 04/30/19	300 1,200 25,000	300 1,200 25,000 \$ 66,400

CAR Section I Liability Revision Date Page 8 of 12 Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan Liability 2020.07.01 8 of 12

B. Adjustment to Reflect the Ultimate Level of Losses (See D.2. of this Section)

<u>Year</u> (1)	Maturity (2)	Premium Subject To Experience Rating (Step II) (3)	AELR (Step II) (4)	Table B <u>LDF</u> (5)	Adjustment to Reflect Ultimate Level of Losses (3) x (4) x (5) (6)	
05/01/16 - 04/30/17	48	\$ 20,750	0.636	0.000	\$ 0	
05/01/17 - 04/30/18	36	21,675	0.636	0.000	0	
05/01/18 - 04/30/19	24	22,700	0.636	0.000	<u>0</u>	
		\$ 65,125			\$ 0	
IV. Experience Modification						
Credil Adjus Basic (\$6 Basic Actua	0.26 0.636 \$ 66,400 \$ 65,125					

Experience Modification = $\frac{1.020 - 0.636}{0.636}$ x 0.26 = 0.157 (factor of 1.157) or a 15.7% debit

1.020

CAR | Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan | Section I | Liability | 2020.07.01 | Page | 9 of 12

Liability Experience Rating Plan Factors

Table C – Credibility, Adjusted Expected Loss Ratios and Maximum Single Losses

			Adjuste	Maximum		
<u>Premiun</u>	ı Level	Credibility	Taxicabs	Zone Rated	All Other	Single Loss
4 #00	6.640	0.00	0.7.0	0.740	0.774	• • • • • •
1,500 -	6,640	0.03	0.550	0.543	0.554	20,000
6,641 -	8,627	0.04	0.565	0.558	0.569	21,783
8,628 -	10,655	0.05	0.574	0.567	0.578	23,044
10,656 -	12,727	0.06	0.581	0.574	0.585	24,001
12,728 -	14,844	0.07	0.586	0.579	0.591	24,827
14,845 -	17,007	0.08	0.591	0.584	0.595	25,544
17,008 -	19,218	0.09	0.595	0.588	0.599	26,196
19,219 -	21,478	0.10	0.598	0.591	0.603	26,826
21,479 -	23,789	0.11	0.601	0.594	0.606	27,413
23,790 -	26,153	0.12	0.604	0.597	0.609	28,000
25,770	20,133	0.12	0.001	0.577	0.007	20,000
26,154 -	28,572	0.13	0.607	0.600	0.612	28,565
28,573 -	31,047	0.14	0.610	0.602	0.614	29,130
31,048 -	33,580	0.15	0.612	0.605	0.616	29,673
33,581 -	36,175	0.16	0.614	0.607	0.619	30,238
36,176 -	38,832	0.17	0.616	0.609	0.621	30,803
ŕ	ŕ					ŕ
38,833 -	41,554	0.18	0.618	0.611	0.623	31,368
41,555 -	44,344	0.19	0.620	0.613	0.625	31,933
44,345 -	47,204	0.20	0.622	0.614	0.626	32,498
47,205 -	50,138	0.21	0.624	0.616	0.628	33,085
50,139 -	53,148	0.22	0.625	0.618	0.630	33,694
53,149 -	56,236	0.23	0.627	0.619	0.631	34,281
56,237 -	59,406	0.24	0.628	0.621	0.633	34,890
59,407 -	62,660	0.25	0.630	0.623	0.635	35,520
62,661 -	66,002	0.26	0.632	0.624	0.636	36,150
66,003 -	69,437	0.27	0.633	0.626	0.638	36,802
60.420	72.060	0.20	0.625	0.627	0.620	25.454
69,438 -	72,969	0.28	0.635	0.627	0.639	37,454
72,970 -	76,600	0.29	0.636	0.628	0.641	38,128
76,601 -	80,337	0.30	0.637	0.630	0.642	38,824
80,338 -	84,183	0.31	0.639	0.631	0.643	39,520
84,184 -	88,142	0.32	0.640	0.632	0.645	40,237

CAR Section I Liability
Revision Date Page 10 of 12

Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan
Liability

10 of 12

Liability Experience Rating Plan Factors

Table C – Credibility, Adjusted Expected Loss Ratios and Maximum Single Losses

			<u>Adjuste</u>	Maximum		
<u>Premiu</u>	m Level	Credibility	Taxicabs	Zone Rated	All Other	Single Loss
88,143 -	92,220	0.33	0.641	0.634	0.646	40,976
92,221 -	96,424	0.34	0.643	0.635	0.647	41,737
96,425 -	100,757	0.35	0.644	0.636	0.649	42,498
100,758 -	105,226	0.36	0.645	0.638	0.650	43,302
105,227 -	109,838	0.37	0.647	0.639	0.651	44,106
109,839 -	114,599	0.38	0.648	0.640	0.653	44,936
114,600 -	119,519	0.39	0.649	0.641	0.654	45,801
119,520 -	124,606	0.40	0.650	0.643	0.655	46,671
124.607 -	129,865	0.41	0.652	0.644	0.656	47,584
129,866 -	135,307	0.42	0.653	0.645	0.657	48,497
135,308 -	140,942	0.43	0.654	0.646	0.659	49,475
140,943 -	146,779	0.44	0.655	0.647	0.660	50,453
146,780 -	152,832	0.45	0.656	0.648	0.661	51,475
152,833 -	159,110	0.46	0.657	0.649	0.662	52,518
159,111 -	165,627	0.47	0.658	0.650	0.663	53,605
165,628 -	172,397	0.48	0.659	0.651	0.663	54,735
172,398 -	179,436	0.49	0.659	0.651	0.664	55,887
179,437 -	186,758	0.50	0.660	0.652	0.665	57,104
186,759 -	194.382	0.51	0.661	0.653	0.666	58,343
194,383 -	202,328	0.52	0.661	0.654	0.666	59,647
202,329 -	210,616	0.53	0.662	0.654	0.667	60,973
210,617 -	219,268	0.54	0.663	0.655	0.668	62,386
219,269 -	228,308	0.55	0.663	0.656	0.668	63,842
228,309 -	237,765	0.56	0.664	0.656	0.669	65,342
237,766 -	247,668	0.57	0.665	0.657	0.670	66,929
247,669 -	258,046	0.58	0.665	0.657	0.670	68,581
258,047 -	268,937	0.59	0.666	0.658	0.671	70,298
268,938 -	280,380	0.60	0.667	0.659	0.671	72,124
280,381 -	292,417	0.61	0.667	0.659	0.672	74,015
292,418 -	305,096	0.62	0.668	0.660	0.673	75,993

CAR | Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan | Section I | Liability | 2020.07.01 | Page | 11 of 12

Liability Experience Rating Plan Factors

Table C – Credibility, Adjusted Expected Loss Ratios and Maximum Single Losses

<u>Premiu</u>	ım Level	Credibility	Adjuste Taxicabs	d Expected I Zone Rated		Maximum Single Loss
205.007	210 471	0.62	0.660	0.660	0.672	70.000
305,097 -	318,471	0.63	0.668	0.660	0.673	78,080
318,472 -	332,597	0.64	0.669	0.661	0.674	80,275
332,598 -	347,544	0.65	0.669	0.661	0.674	82,601
347,545 -	363,382	0.66	0.670	0.662	0.675	85,057
363,383 -	380,197	0.67	0.670	0.662	0.675	87,644
380,198 -	398,079	0.68	0.671	0.663	0.676	90,405
398,080 -	417,134	0.69	0.671	0.663	0.676	93,318
417,135 -	437,478	0.70	0.672	0.664	0.676	96,426
437,479 -	459,251	0.71	0.672	0.664	0.677	99,730
459,252 -	482,609	0.72	0.672	0.664	0.677	103,317
482,610 -	507,731	0.73	0.673	0.665	0.678	107,078
507,732 -	534,822	0.74	0.673	0.665	0.678	111,165
534,823 -	564,124	0.75	0.674	0.666	0.678	115,556
564,125 -	595,917	0.76	0.674	0.666	0.679	120,316
595,918 -	630,539	0.77	0.674	0.666	0.679	125,468
630,540 -	668,379	0.78	0.675	0.667	0.679	131,076
668,380 -	709,914	0.79	0.675	0.667	0.680	137,206
709,915 -	755,709	0.80	0.675	0.667	0.680	143,923
755,710 -	806,450	0.81	0 676	0.668	0.681	151,335
806,451 -	862,995	0.82	0.676	0.668	0.681	159,552
862,996 -	926,395	0.83	0.676	0.668	0.681	168,682
926,396 -	997,972	0.84	0.677	0.669	0.682	178,942
997,973 -	1,079,420	0.85	0.677	0.669	0.682	190,506
1,079,421 -	1,172,939	0.86	0.677	0.669	0.682	203,679
1,172,940 -	1,281,416	0.87	0.678	0.670	0.683	218,786
1,281,417 -	1,408,760	0.88	0.678	0.670	0.683	236,306
1,408,761 -	1,560,360	0.89	0.679	0.670	0.684	256,891
1,560,361 -	1,743,877	0.90	0.679	0.671	0.684	281,367
1,743,878 -	1,970,579	0.91	0.679	0.671	0.684	311,017
1,970,580 -	2,257,733	0.92	0.679	0.671	0.684	347,623

CAR Section I Liability
Revision Date Page 12 of 12

Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan
Liability

1 2020.07.01

Liability Experience Rating Plan Factors

Table C – Credibility, Adjusted Expected Loss Ratios and Maximum Single Losses

			Adjusted Expected Loss Ratio			Maximum
<u>Premiu</u>	m Level	Credibility	Taxicabs	Zone Rated	All Other	Single Loss
2,257,734 -	2,633,237	0.93	0.679	0.671	0.684	394,010
2,633,238 -	3,145,291		0.680	0.672	0.685	454,657
3,145,292 -	3,884,927	0.95	0.680	0.672	0.685	537,346
3,884,928 -	5,047,205	0.96	0.680	0.672	0.685	656,792
5,047,206 -	7,139,307	0.97	0.681	0.673	0.686	844,493
7,139,308 -	12,020,880	0.98	0.681	0.673	0.686	1,182,355
12,020,881-	36,428,755	0.99	0.681	0.673	0.686	1,970,700
36,428,756	and Over	1.00	0.681	0.673	0.686	5,912,383