



NATALIE A. HUBLEY  
PRESIDENT

# COMMONWEALTH AUTOMOBILE REINSURERS

101 Arch Street, Suite 400 Boston, Massachusetts 02110

www.commauto.com

617-338-4000

## RECORDS OF MEETING

### ACTUARIAL COMMITTEE – JUNE 10, 2026

#### Members Present

Ms. Meredith Woodcock – Chair	Liberty Mutual Insurance Companies
Mr. Andrew Brown	Plymouth Rock Assurance Corporation
Ms. Melinda Etschman	Arbella Insurance Group
Ms. Katherine McCarthy <sup>(1)</sup>	Quincy Mutual Group
Mr. Jeffrey Price	The Hanover Insurance Company
Mr. Thomas Spankroy	GEICO
Mr. Christopher Walendin	Safety Insurance Company
Mr. Joshua Wykle	Vermont Mutual Insurance Group
Ms. Qianyi Zhao <sup>(2)</sup>	MAPFRE U.S.A. Corporation

#### Substituted for:

<sup>(1)</sup>Mr. Todd Lehmann

<sup>(2)</sup>Ms. Sarah Clemens

#### Not in Attendance:

Mr. Mark Winiker, Acrisure East Insurance Services, LLC

#### 26.01 Records of Previous Meeting

The Committee unanimously voted to approve the Records of the Actuarial Committee meeting of February 5, 2026. The Records have been distributed and are on file.

#### 26.04 Quota Share Credits for Policies Effective April 1, 2027 and Later

Chair Meredith Woodcock summarized the Committee’s prior meeting discussion. She noted that because the credit factors have been in place since 2015, the Committee had discussed at length the need to realign credits to respond to areas with indicated need. To continue its discussion, the Committee directed staff to prepare the standard Rule 29 credit indications as well as the indications tempered to limit reductions to credit factors to avoid market disruption. The Committee also requested staff to prepare three permutations of the tempered model to off-balance overall credit premium increases and to update the Plymouth Rock model with the more recent data.

Mr. Evan Ross presented an overview of the exhibits attached to the notice of meeting. He explained that the credit models have been updated to include data as of March 2026. Further, he noted that exhibits 10, 11, and 12 modify the tempered Rule 29 indications to off-balance all credit factors, limit

reductions to off-balanced credit factors in DOI territories to a minimum of 1 credit, and to off-balance factors only in non-DOI territories, respectively. Mr. Ross noted that additional exhibits illustrate MAIP rate adequacy for each class/territory cell, as well as current assignment volumes and residual market shares.

Speaking briefly of the Plymouth Rock model, Mr. Andrew Brown explained that this model calculates proposed credit factors based on a current evaluation of disproportionate representation in the residual market. The model reduces proportionally the residual market share threshold established in 2010-2012 that would indicate potential credit need, based on current residual market shares. The model then allows all indicated credit changes based on the recalibrated definition of disproportionate representation, but limits decreases to credit factors in the DOI territories by setting a minimum credit level of 1.00 in those cells. Mr. Brown asserted that this approach to redefine disproportionate representation is responsive to the statute and is most likely to be supported by the Division of Insurance.

Mr. Joshua Wykle recognized that committee members historically have been reluctant to propose increases to credit premium volumes when the residual market volume is small and showing trends of continued decreases. However, he asserted that introduction of credits to areas where there is an indicated need cannot be achieved without an increase to credits overall, particularly if CAR must limit credit decreases in the “DOI territories”. Mr. Wykle noted that Class 10 residual market shares in territories 14 and 15 almost double those in territory 40 and other DOI territories. Furthermore, he observed that an increase to credits would only reduce the value of a credit and urged committee members to reconsider their reluctance to increase credit volumes.

Mr. Brown agreed, explaining that the recalibration of the residual market share threshold is a more appropriate alternative to the tempered Rule 29 indications previously supported by a majority of committee members. He asserted that the model addresses all concerns raised in prior DOI credit decisions. That is, the model limits credit reductions in the DOI territories, recognizes disproportionate representation, and does not reduce overall credits.

Mr. Christopher Walenden recognized the benefit of the recalibrated definition of disproportionate representation to introduce credits where there is indicated need. However, he suggested consideration of partially limiting the overall increases in the Plymouth Rock model. Other members suggested reaching out to the Division of Insurance to inquire if there is a change in position regarding those concerns raised in its prior decisions.

After significant discussion, the Committee voted with five members in favor and four opposed to adopt the Plymouth Rock model. Staff was directed, for the next Committee meeting, to update the model with recent available data and draft amendments to Rule 29 reflective of the final credit factors.

TIMOTHY GALLIGAN  
Director of Actuarial & Statistical Services

Boston, Massachusetts  
June 11, 2026

**ATTACHMENT LISTING**

Docket #AC26.02, Exhibit #2

Attendance Listing

**ACTUARIAL COMMITTEE MEETING  
MEETING ATTENDEES  
JUNE 10, 2026**

Individual's Name

Company / Agency

PLEASE PRINT

Meredith Woodcock	Liberty Mutual Insurance Companies
Andrew Brown	Plymouth Rock Assurance Corporation
Melinda Etschman	Arbella Insurance Group
Katherine McCarthy	Quincy Mutual Group
Jeffrey Price	The Hanover Insurance Company
Thomas Spankroy	GEICO
Christopher Walendin	Safety Insurance Company
Joshua Wykle	Vermont Mutual Insurance Group
Qianyi Zhao	MAPFRE U.S.A. Corporation
Monique Miller	AIB
Margaret Barao	Division of Insurance
Ron Martin	Preferred Mutual Insurance Company
Wendy Browne	CAR Staff
Shannon Chiu	CAR Staff
Timothy Galligan	CAR Staff
Steven Gautieri	CAR Staff
Richard Heath	CAR Staff
Natalie Hubley	CAR Staff
Katy Proctor	CAR Staff
Lynne Rosenberg	CAR Staff
Evan Ross	CAR Staff
Robin Tigges	CAR Staff