

COMMONWEALTH AUTOMOBILE REINSURERS

225 Franklin Street Boston, Massachusetts 02110 www.commauto.com 617-338-4000

DANIEL R. JUDSON PRESIDENT

November 17, 2011

BULLETIN NO. 949

PROPOSED CHANGES TO THE RULES OF OPERATION

At its meeting of November 16, 2011, the Governing Committee voted to amend the following Rule of Operation by deleting and adding the language as indicated in the attached copy. A copy of the Filing Letter, which contains an explanation of the Rule changes, is attached for your information.

The impacted Rule is listed below.

Rule 29 – Assignment Process

This Bulletin, with a copy of the proposed changes to the Rule listed above, is being furnished to every Member Company as required in Article X of the Plan of Operation. Any Member Company may request a public hearing within five days of receipt of this Bulletin and Filing Letter, as provided by Article X of the Plan of Operation.

A proposed Rule shall become effective upon the written approval of the Commissioner or upon the expiration of 30 days after filing, provided the Commissioner has not previously disapproved the Rule in writing.

DANIEL R. JUDSON President

Attachment



COMMONWEALTH AUTOMOBILE REINSURERS

225 Franklin Street Boston, Massachusetts 02110 www.commauto.com 617-338-4000

DANIEL R. JUDSON PRESIDENT

November 17, 2011

Honorable Joseph G. Murphy Commissioner of Insurance Massachusetts Division of Insurance 1000 Washington Street, Suite 810 Boston, MA 02118

Proposed Changes to the Rules of Operation

Dear Commissioner Murphy:

In accordance with the provisions of Article X of the Plan of Operation, I hereby file, at the request of the Governing Committee, amendments to the following Rule of Operation:

Rule 29 – Assignment Process

Changes are shown by deleting and adding the language as indicated on the attached copy. The remainder of the Rule is unchanged.

Explanation

In correspondence dated October 12, 2011, the Division of Insurance disapproved amendments to Rule 29.D.1. and D.2. which had been previously filed on September 22, 2011, citing unintended and unwanted consequences if the proposed amendments were implemented as filed. The Governing Committee has approved alternate amendments to Rule 29.D.1. and D.2. to address the Commissioner's directive to eliminate the option to extend an assigned policy beyond the three-year assignment period, while preserving the Rule 29 non-renewal procedures currently in place.

Rule 29.D.1. has been amended to state that for policies whose assignment period ends on March 31, 2012 and prior, an Assigned Risk Company (ARC) may continue an assignment beyond three years by offering a third renewal, writing the policy on a voluntary basis or non-renewing the policy. Additionally, for policies whose assignment period ends on April 1, 2012 and subsequent, an ARC may only offer to write the policy on a voluntary basis or non-renew the policy.

Rule 29.D.2. has been amended to clarify that the previously approved non-renewal procedures apply to those policies whose three-year assignment period ends effective January 1, 2012 and subsequent and the ARC intends to non-renew the policy at the end of the assignment period.

Operationally, ARCs have implemented procedures in accordance with the previously approved non-renewal requirements specified in Rule 29 D.2. to notify the Assigned Risk Producer (ARP) of those policyholders the ARC will be non-renewing effective throughout January, February, and March 2012.

Company underwriting procedures and corresponding systems will need to be redefined in order to comport with the proposed amendments as of December 1, 2011 in order to notify ARPs of those assigned policies to be non-renewed as of April 1, 2012 and subsequent.

The volume of business impacted by the proposed effective date is relatively small as only those risks meeting the limited eligibility requirements for MAIP placement with policy effective dates in January, February, or March 2009 will be affected. The intended goal of maintaining the integrity of the assignment process, and providing incentives for consumers to shop for insurance will be met by addressing those assigned risks placed through MAIP as of April 1, 2009 when MAIP became fully operational.

A copy of the proposed amendments to Rule 29 is attached hereto, and is being furnished to every Member Company, the two associations of insurance producers, and the Public Protection Division of the Office of the Attorney General, as required by Article X of the Plan of Operation.

Very truly yours, and R. fr

Daniel R. Judson President

Attachment: Rule 29 – Assignment Process

cc: Assigned Risk Producers of Massachusetts, Inc. Massachusetts Association of Insurance Agents Public Protection Division – Office of the Attorney General

CARRules of OperationRule 29Assignment ProcessRevision Date2011.07.18Page1 of 12

A. <u>Calculation of Initial Quota Share</u>

For the purposes of calculating a Member's initial Quota Share, the Member's voluntary market share will be the ratio of each Member's written property damage liability exposures for the 12-month period ending June 30, 2007 with CAR ID codes 0 or 1 over the industry written exposures for the 12-month period ending June 30, 2007 with CAR ID 0 or 1. Exposures for motorcycles, snowmobiles, and electric motor vehicles will be adjusted by a factor of 0.33.

B. Assignment of Applications

The MAIP shall randomly assign applications that are eligible for coverage based on each Member's individual Quota Share. A Member's Quota Share shall reflect that Member's proportion of Private Passenger Motor Vehicle MAIP premiums that its respective voluntary private passenger property damage liability direct written exposures bears to the statewide total of voluntary private passenger property damage liability direct written exposures of all companies in the state.

- 1. For the purpose of such distribution as described above: (1) voluntary private passenger property damage liability direct written exposures; and (2) private passenger MAIP premiums shall be defined as below:
 - a. Voluntary private passenger property damage liability direct written exposures shall be the number of private passenger property damage liability car years written by the company for the most recent 12 months, regardless of the type of Motor Vehicle Insurance policy under which such property damage liability car years are written, excluding private passenger liability car years written through the MAIP. Exposures for motorcycles, snowmobiles, and electric motor vehicles will be adjusted by a factor of 0.33.

Exposures that qualify as a Clean-in-Three Risk pursuant to Rule 22 as of the effective date of their current Private Passenger Motor Vehicle Insurance policy will be adjusted by a factor of 0.0 provided all of the following conditions are met:

CARRules of OperationRule 29Assignment ProcessRevision Date2011.07.18Page2 of 12

- The operator was insured under a Private Passenger Motor Vehicle Insurance policy issued by the Assigned Risk Company (ARC) with an effective date between April 1, 2008 and March 31, 2009;
- (2) The producer of record for the policy between April 1, 2008 through March 31, 2009 that insured the operator was exclusively assigned to the Member by CAR; and
- (3) The producer of record for the operator has not changed since March 31, 2009.
- b. For the purpose of establishing the Quota Share of a Newly Writing Company that becomes eligible for appointment as an ARC pursuant to Rule 30 before that Member is required to submit detailed statistical data under the provisions of the Massachusetts Private Passenger Automobile Statistical Plan, the Member is required to report interim summary data pursuant to Rule 29.C.
- c. Private Passenger Motor Vehicle MAIP premiums shall be developed from the MAIP rates and rating plan and shall include the total of: 20/40 bodily injury (including guest), \$100,000 property damage liability, and \$8,000 personal injury protection manual premiums excluding subsidies calculated using MAIP cost-based rates and adjusted for the MAIP merit rating plan for Private Passenger Motor Vehicle MAIP insureds and any risk voluntarily insured that is eligible for premium credits allowed pursuant to this Rule.
- 2. MAIP will assign applications to the most undersubscribed Member as defined by the ratio of the Member's assigned MAIP premium to the Member's credit-adjusted Quota Share. In the event this ratio is the same for two or more Members, MAIP will assign the application to the most undersubscribed of those Members based upon the difference between each Member's assigned MAIP premium and its credit-adjusted Quota Share. All assignments are subject to the distribution restrictions relative to the assignment process pursuant to Section F. below. After assignment, MAIP will update the accumulated assigned MAIP premium and recalculate each Member's ratio of assigned MAIP premium to credit-adjusted Quota Share.

CARRules of OperationRule 29Assignment ProcessRevision Date2011.07.18Page3 of 12

C. Quota Share Adjustment

The MAIP shall adjust the assigned premium Quota Share of each Member monthly, in order to correct for the amount of previously assigned MAIP premium which was less than or in excess of each Member's appropriate share of total MAIP premium, for the amount of premium connected with reversed assignments due to non-payment or insufficient funds, and for the amount of premium associated with MAIP risks moving to the voluntary market or adjustments for any applicable credits. On a monthly basis, the MAIP shall notify each Member of its market share and premium Quota Share adjustments.

1. To determine the current premium Quota Share of a Newly Writing Company that becomes eligible for appointment as an ARC pursuant to Rule 30.A.1. before that Member is required to submit detailed statistical data under the provisions of the Massachusetts Private Passenger Automobile Statistical Plan, the Member is required to report interim summary data to CAR beginning no later than the 23month anniversary of the calendar date on which the Member's initial Private Passenger Motor Vehicle Insurance rates and manual become effective. The Member will be required to report private passenger property damage liability car months of exposure by CAR identification code, policy effective month, premium town, classification, and merit rating status as defined in the Massachusetts Private Passenger Automobile Statistical Plan. The initial report will include the 12 consecutive policy effective months that will be used to determine the Member's initial Quota Share. Monthly data will be reported thereafter until the Member commences reporting detailed statistical data to CAR.

An additional adjustment shall be made to the latest rolling 12-month voluntary exposure based market share that is used to determine the current premium Quota Share of a Member(s) when that Member(s) is part of an insurer group that includes any other insurance company that qualifies as a Newly Writing Company, and that Newly Writing Company has elected to be treated as a Member separate from the current Member(s) under these Rules. This adjustment shall continue until the Newly Writing Company become eligible for appointment as an ARC pursuant to Rule 30.

CARRules of OperationRule 29Assignment ProcessRevision Date2011.07.18Page4 of 12

The latest rolling 12-month voluntary exposure based market share used to determine such Member(s) current premium Quota Share shall not be adjusted to reflect any reduction in vehicle exposures that were insured under a Private Passenger Motor Vehicle Insurance policy issued voluntarily by such Member(s) immediately prior to the vehicle's initial policy inception date with such Newly Writing Company.

This adjustment will apply regardless of whether the initial policy inception date with the Newly Writing Company pre-dates the calendar months underlying the latest rolling 12-month voluntary exposure based market share used to determine the Member(s) current premium Quota Share.

2. To determine the current premium Quota Share of a Newly Writing Company that becomes eligible for appointment as an ARC pursuant to Rule 30.A.2 before that Member is required to submit detailed statistical data under the provisions of the Massachusetts Private Passenger Automobile Statistical Plan, the Member is required to report interim summary data to CAR. The Member shall begin reporting summary data no later than 45 days after the close of the month of the Member's initial Private Passenger Motor Vehicle Insurance rates and rate manual effective date. The Member will be required to report written private passenger property damage liability car months of exposure by CAR identification code, policy effective month, territory, classification, and merit rating status as defined in the Massachusetts Private Passenger Automobile Statistical Plan. Monthly summary data will be reported thereafter until the Member commences reporting detailed statistical data to CAR.

D. Assignment Period

1. An Eligible Risk shall be insured by a designated ARC for a period of three consecutive years.

For policies of an Eligible Risk whose assignment period ends March 31, 2012 and prior Tthe designated ARC may offer to continue an Eligible Risk's assignment beyond the period of three consecutive years by offering to write a third or subsequent renewal, may offer to write the policy on a voluntary basis, or may non-renew the policy.

CARRules of OperationRule 29Assignment ProcessRevision Date2011.07.18Page5 of 12

For policies of an Eligible Risk whose three year assignment period ends effective April 1, 2012 and subsequent, the designated ARC may offer to write the policy on a voluntary basis, or may non-renew the policy.

2. For policies <u>whose three year assignment period ends</u> effective January 1, 2012 and subsequent, if the Eligible Risk's assignment is not to be continued, and the designated ARC has not made an offer to write the policy on a voluntary basis if the designated ARC intends to non-renew the policy at the end of the three year assignment period the following procedures shall apply.

On or about the first business day of the month, the designated ARC will distribute to the ARP a list of policies that the ARC does not intend to renew and which will expire during the month at least 120 days from the distribution date, thereby providing the ARP an opportunity to seek replacement coverage in the voluntary market. If replacement coverage is obtained for the risk, the ARP shall submit a Notice of Transfer of Insurer (2A Form) to the former ARC identifying the new carrier.

No less than 60 days prior to the expiration date, if replacement coverage is not obtained for the Eligible Risk, the ARP shall submit an application to the MAIP. The application will be assigned to a Member such that the designated ARC is different than the former ARC. Upon receiving the assignment, the ARP shall submit a 2A Form to the former ARC identifying the newly designated ARC. A down payment is not required and upon receipt of the application, the newly designated ARC will bill the applicant for 20% of the premium to be charged, which shall be the lower of the MAIP premium or the voluntary premium for which the applicant qualifies.

If no 2A Form is received, the designated ARC will issue a nonrenewal notice at least 45 days prior to the expiration date with a copy sent to the ARP.

Upon receipt of the non-renewal notice, the Eligible Risk may reapply for coverage through the MAIP. Such reapplication shall be considered a new business application and the Eligible Risk shall be assigned to a different Member such that the designated ARC is different than the former ARC.

3. In the case of a non-resident military person, pursuant to Rule 26.A.1.c., the designated ARC need not renew if at the time of the renewal the policyholder is stationed in another state and his motor vehicle is not registered in Massachusetts.

CARRules of OperationRule 29Assignment ProcessRevision Date2011.07.18Page6 of 12

E. Credit Programs

All credits for each rate year shall be reviewed annually and submitted to the Commissioner for his approval. Any premium credited under this Rule that in aggregate exceeds 100% of the overall Quota Share may not be credited against the Quota Share.

- 1. Voluntary Credit
 - a. For polices with effective dates of April 1, 2009 and subsequent, a Member shall receive a credit for any exposure that it insures voluntarily in the territory and operator classes pursuant to Section E.2. below.
 - b. Credit shall be applied to the Member's Quota Share pursuant to Section 29.C. above for the appropriate premiums pursuant to Section E.2. below.
- 2. Amount of Credits

Members shall receive credit for each exposure written voluntarily pursuant to Section E.1.b. above in the territory and operator classes listed below. The amount of credit shall equal the annual Private Passenger Motor Vehicle MAIP premium for the risk as if it has been insured through the MAIP, multiplied by the factor shown below.

CARRules of OperationRule 29Assignment ProcessRevision Date2011.07.18Page7 of 12

The following factors are applicable for policies with effective dates from April 1, 2009 through March 31, 2010.

	Operator Class									
Territory	10	15	17	18	20	21	25	26	30	M/M*
01					1.0		0.5			
02					1.0		0.5			
03					1.5		0.5			
04					1.5		0.5			
05					1.5	0.5	0.5			
06			0.5		1.5		0.5			
07			0.5		1.5	1.0	1.0			
08			0.5		1.5	0.5	1.0			
09			1.0		1.5	1.0	1.0	0.5		
10			1.0		1.5	1.0	1.0	0.5		
11			1.0		1.5	1.0	1.0			
12			1.0		1.5	1.0	1.0	0.5		0.5
13			1.0		2.0	1.0	1.0	1.0		0.5
14			1.0	0.5	1.5	1.0	1.0	1.0		1.0
15	0.5	0.5	1.0	1.0	2.5	1.0	1.0	0.5		1.0
16	1.0	1.0	1.5	0.5	2.0	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.0	1.0
17			1.0		2.0	1.0	1.5			
18	0.5	0.5	1.5		2.0	1.0	1.5			1.0
19	0.5	0.5	1.5	1.0	2.0	0.5	1.0			1.0
20	0.5	0.5	1.5		2.0	1.5	2.0	1.5	1.0	1.0
21	0.5	1.0	1.5	1.0	2.0	1.5	1.5	1.0	0.5	1.0
22	1.0	1.0	1.5	1.0	2.0	1.5	1.5	1.0	1.5	1.5
23			1.0		2.0	1.0	1.5	0.5		1.0
24			1.0		2.0	1.0	1.0	0.5		1.0
25			1.0		1.5	0.5	1.0	0.5	0.5	1.0
26			1.5	1.0	2.0	1.0	1.0	0.5		1.0
27					1.0		0.5			
40	0.5		1.5	1.0	2.5	1.5	1.0	1.0		1.0
41			1.5		2.0	1.5	1.0	1.0		0.5
42	0.5	0.5	1.5	0.5	2.0	1.0	1.0	1.0		1.0
43	1.0	0.5	1.5	1.0	2.5	1.5	1.0	1.0		0.5
44	0.5	0.5	1.0	0.5	2.0	1.0	1.0	1.0		1.0
45	1.0	0.5	1.5	1.0	2.0	1.5	1.5	1.0	1.0	1.0
99						0.5		0.5		

* Motorcycle and Miscellaneous Classes

CARRules of OperationRule 29Assignment ProcessRevision Date2011.07.18Page8 of 12

The following factors are applicable for policies with effective dates from April 1, 2010 through March 31, 2011.

	Operator Class									
Territory	10	15	17	18	20	21	25	26	30	M/M*
01					0.8					
02					0.8					
03					1.5					
04					0.8					
05			0.25		1.5	0.35				
06					1.5					
07			0.25		1.5	0.75				
08			0.25		1.5		0.25			
09			0.7		1.5	0.35	0.25			
10			0.25		1.5	0.75				
11			0.25		1.5		0.25			
12			0.25		1.5	0.75	0.25			0.35
13			0.8		1.5	0.75	0.7			0.35
14			0.7		1.5	0.35	0.7			0.75
15	0.35		0.7	0.35	3.5	1.75	1.5		0.35	0.85
16	0.85		1.5	0.85	3.5	1.75	1.5	1.75	0.75	0.85
17			0.7		1.5		1.5			
18	0.35		0.8		2.5		0.25		0.35	0.75
19			1.5		2.5		0.8			0.75
20	0.35		1.5	0.35	2.5		0.8	0.35	0.35	0.85
21	0.75	0.35	1.5	0.75	2.5	1.75	1.5		0.75	0.85
22	0.85	0.75	1.5	0.35	2.5	0.85	0.8			1.75
23			1.5		3.5	0.75	1.5			0.85
24			0.7		1.5	0.85	0.8			0.75
25			0.8		1.5	0.75				
26	0.35		1.5	0.35	2.5	1.75	0.8			0.85
27					1.5					
40	0.85		1.5		3.5	0.85	1.5			0.85
41	0.35		1.5	0.75	1.5	1.75	1.5	0.35		0.35
42	0.85		1.5	0.75	2.5	1.75	0.8			0.85
43	0.75		0.8	0.35	2.5	1.75	0.8			0.35
44	0.75		0.8	0.75	2.5	0.85	0.8	0.35	0.35	0.85
45	0.75		1.5		2.5	0.85	1.5		0.35	0.85
99										

* Motorcycle and Miscellaneous Classes

CARRules of OperationRule 29Assignment ProcessRevision Date2011.07.18Page9 of 12

The following factors are applicable for policies with effective dates of April 1, 2011 and subsequent.

	Operator Class									
Territory	10	15	17	18	20	21	25	26	30	M/M*
01					0.8					
02					0.8					
03					0.8					
04					0.8					
05			0.25		1.5	0.35				
06					0.8					
07			0.25		1.5	0.35				
08			0.25		1.5	0.35				
09			0.7		1.5	0.35	0.25			
10			0.25		1.5	0.35				
11			0.7		1.5	0.35	0.25			
12			0.7		1.5	0.35	0.25			
13			0.7		1.5	0.75	0.7			0.35
14			0.7		1.5		0.7			0.35
15			0.8	0.35	1.5	1.75	1.5			0.85
16	0.75		1.5	0.85	2.5	0.75	1.5		0.35	0.85
17			0.7		1.5		0.7			
18	0.35		1.5		1.5	1.75	0.8			0.35
19			1.5	0.35	1.5	0.75	0.8			0.35
20	0.75		1.5	0.35	1.5	0.85	0.8	0.85		0.85
21	0.85	0.35	1.5	0.85	2.5	1.75	1.5		0.75	0.85
22	0.85	0.75	1.5	0.35	2.5	0.85	1.5	0.35		0.85
23			0.8		2.5	0.85	1.5			0.75
24			0.7		1.5	0.35	0.7			
25			0.8		1.5	0.85	0.7			
26	0.35		0.8	0.35	2.5	1.75	0.8			0.75
27					0.8					
40	0.85		1.5	0.85	2.5	1.75	0.8			0.85
41	0.35		1.5	0.75	1.5	1.75	0.8			0.35
42	0.85		1.5	0.75	1.5	1.75	0.8			0.85
43	0.75		0.8	0.35	2.5	0.85	0.8			0.35
44	0.75		0.8	0.75	1.5	0.75	0.8	0.35	0.35	0.85
45	0.75		1.5	0.75	2.5	0.85	0.8			0.75
99										

* Motorcycle and Miscellaneous Classes

CARRules of OperationRule 29Assignment ProcessRevision Date2011.07.18Page10 of 12

3. Take-Out Credit

For policies with effective dates on or after April 1, 2009, a Member shall receive credit for each exposure previously insured through the MAIP or that had been ceded to CAR (CAR ID Codes 4 and 5) that it writes voluntarily at the expiration of that policy. A Member may receive a credit for the first year in which an Eligible Risk is written voluntarily after the expiration of the policy previously issued through the residual market.

The value of a take-out credit shall equal the annual Private Passenger Motor Vehicle MAIP premium pursuant to Section B.1.b. above, that the risk would have been charged if he had been insured through the MAIP, multiplied by a factor of 1.0. Take-out credits are applied in addition to any voluntary credit(s) pursuant to Section E.2. above.

To qualify for take-out credit, all of the following requirements must be met:

- a. The Member must provide proper notification prior to the expiration of the policy;
- b. The voluntary policy must be in effect for at least 90 days;
- c. The kinds and amounts of coverage to be offered to a voluntary risk shall at least equal those in the policy being replaced;
- d. The Member shall be required to submit an approved monthly reporting form to the MAIP for all policies qualifying for credit during the month and to submit supporting data to the MAIP upon request; and
- e. The Member shall, if requested by the MAIP, agree to a physical audit of its records to substantiate the credits and exposures stated in the monthly report. The executed request for credit form must be submitted to the MAIP by the last day of the fourth month following the effective date of the policy.

CARRules of OperationRule 29Assignment ProcessRevision Date2011.07.18Page11 of 12

F. Distribution Restrictions

Distribution shall be made on the basis that any applicant eligible for assignment under the MAIP Rules shall be assigned or reassigned to any Member with a Quota Share, subject to the following restrictions:

- 1. No risk shall be assigned to more than one Member.
- 2. Reassignment to Prior Member

In the case where an applicant or policyholder has been cancelled for non-payment of premium, or has an outstanding premium balance due a Member and is otherwise eligible for placement through the MAIP pursuant to G.L. c. 175, § 113H, the applicant or policyholder is ineligible for assignment to another Member, and will be assigned to that same Member such that the policy premium deposit will be applied first to the outstanding premium due, and any remaining deposit balance will be applied to the new policy.

G. Accruing, Buying, Selling or Transferring Credits

- 1. Eligibility
 - a. Assigned Risk Companies may accrue excess credits.
 - b. As of April 1, 2008, ARCs may sell, transfer, or buy excess credits to or from other ARCs in accordance with the procedures below.
- 2. Operational Procedures

CAR will calculate the volume of excess credit premium eligible for transfer, if any, for each ARC on a monthly basis. Such calculation will be made in conjunction with updates to the statistical base data.

3. Notification of Intent to Transfer Credits

Assigned Risk Companies shall report to CAR within 30 days the execution of any agreement by the ARC to purchase, sell or transfer excess credits. An ARC shall notify CAR by submitting the prescribed authorization form to CAR. The terms of any such agreement must be reviewed by CAR and found to be consistent with CAR Rules.

CARRules of OperationRule 29Assignment ProcessRevision Date2011.07.18Page12 of 12

H. Credits Relating to Clean-in-Three Risks

Not later than December 1, 2011, CAR shall develop a credit mechanism designed to encourage Members to voluntarily insure consumers who are Clean-in-Three Risks and who meet the following criteria:

- 1. The applicant or any person who usually drives the motor vehicle has not failed to pay an insurance company any Private Passenger Motor Vehicle Insurance premiums due or contracted during the preceding 12 months; and
- 2. Any person who usually drives the Private Passenger Motor Vehicle holds or is eligible to obtain an operator's license.

Such credit will be available to Members as of April 1, 2012, when the transitional constraint on non-renewal of Clean-in-Three Risks pursuant to Rule 21.D. has ended.